

Theological Studies

<http://tsj.sagepub.com/>

Book Review: Wake Up, Lazarus! Volume 2, Paths to Catholic Renewal. By Pierre Hégy

Joseph Martos

Theological Studies 2014 75: 428

DOI: 10.1177/0040563914529909I

The online version of this article can be found at:

<http://tsj.sagepub.com/content/75/2/428.citation>

Published by:



<http://www.sagepublications.com>

On behalf of:

Theological Studies, Inc

Additional services and information for *Theological Studies* can be found at:

Email Alerts: <http://tsj.sagepub.com/cgi/alerts>

Subscriptions: <http://tsj.sagepub.com/subscriptions>

Reprints: <http://www.sagepub.com/journalsReprints.nav>

Permissions: <http://www.sagepub.com/journalsPermissions.nav>

>> [Version of Record](#) - May 20, 2014

[What is This?](#)

Although T. does survey a few key Catholic and Orthodox thinkers, his treatment leaves a sense that his real interest is in the Protestant tradition. It is unfortunate that there is no recognition of Heribert Mühlen's *Der Heilige Geist als Person* (1980), and his understanding of "Wir" or "we-relation" that is so influential in the great Catholic theologians of the last century such as Yves Congar and Hans Urs von Balthasar. This absence is all the more noticeable because the relational nature of the Spirit is something T. himself seeks to emphasize. Likewise, it seems strange that T. should not discuss Sergius Bulgakov—mentioned only in passing—and his profound theology of the kenosis of the Spirit, such a rich source for major theologians of the Western church. In their different ways Mühlen and Bulgakov develop a dynamic, philosophically sophisticated Pneumatology that informs and shapes their ecclesiologies. It would have been interesting if T. had given more space to engage with them.

However, any work of such comprehensive ambitions risks leaving itself open to criticism about what it does and does not include. Even so, we must be grateful to T. for taking this risk. Whatever reservations one may have, they should not detract from T.'s achievement and its contribution to the theology of the Holy Spirit. There is much in this study to stimulate discussion, thought, and research. T.'s approach is itself an important example of the hermeneutics of patience and generosity that have often been lacking in the long history of theology's attempt to explore and respond to the reality of the Holy Spirit in Christian life.

James Hanvey, S.J.
Campion Hall, Oxford, UK

Wake Up, Lazarus! Volume 2, Paths to Catholic Renewal. By Pierre Hégy. Bloomington, IN: iUniverse, 2013. Pp. xii + 418. \$27.95.

"And now for something completely different. . . ." This Monty Python tagline aptly introduces this work by Hégy, a work that could well be called an essay in liturgical sociology. H., professor emeritus of sociology at Adelphi University, uses the tools of his profession—primarily observation, interviews, and statistical analysis—to understand what is going on and what is not going on in Catholic worship. The approach is refreshingly different from any other book on liturgy, and it offers a number of novel insights.

Volume 2 is a worthy sequel to volume 1, subtitled *On Catholic Renewal*, which could be called an essay in ecclesial sociology, and which analyzes the decline in church membership since the Second Vatican Council. In both books, H. compares Catholic and Protestant churches to reveal both general trends and uniquely Catholic issues. In volume 2, he bases many of his findings on 100 Sunday worship services and 100 homilies in the United States and Guatemala, which he recorded and on which he took notes. Fluent in Spanish, H. takes the Guatemalan data as indicative (but not necessarily representative) of Latin American worship and preaching.

Participation in Catholic masses increases as one moves from priests' liturgies (with few or no servers), to ministers' liturgies (with a notable number of assistants), to community liturgies (with active involvement of the assembly). H. found that Protestant services were more likely to involve many ministers and the full congregation, whereas Catholic services were more likely to be led by a single priest or a number of ministers, with very few services being genuinely community celebrations. As might be expected, church growth correlated well with increased participation and vice versa.

Contrary to expectations, however, a quantitative analysis of homilies and sermons yielded some surprising results. Preaching by priests tended to be filled with general comments about the readings and spirituality, with little or no time given to the explanation of doctrine or the sharing of faith experiences, whereas lay preachers devoted half of their speaking time to drawing lessons from the Scriptures, explaining the practical implications of doctrine, giving suggestions for prayer, and recounting personal experiences. In short, priests' homilies tended to be abstractly informative, while lay preaching tended to combine ideas with applications for life.

H. also uses traditional sociological concepts to analyze what is going on in the global church since Vatican II—concepts such as the routinization of charisma, amnesia and anamnesis, desacralization, and public piety versus personal spirituality. He points out that the collective memory of young Catholics is markedly different from that of older ones, and argues that pluralism does not necessarily entail relativism. He also shows how conceiving the church as a total institution has severe social costs that increasingly outweigh past social benefits.

Along these lines, H. devotes a chapter to the consequences of papal supremacy for the modern church and its sacraments. This doctrine was not challenged by the bishops at Vatican II, which enabled the three postconciliar pontiffs to co-opt *Lumen gentium's* notion of the people of God by locating the laity on the bottom rung of a hierarchically organized church. Paradoxically, however, total control over bishops and priests has resulted in increasing powerlessness over the laity when they decided not to obey papal directives. The Catholic Church's patronage system, inherited from medieval society and enforced by an ethic of loyalty rather than responsibility, has become dysfunctional in a pluralistic culture with an educated laity.

As an alternative, H. points to the document produced by the fifth general conference of Latin American bishops held in Aparecida, Brazil, in 2007. The Aparecida document envisions the laity as missionary disciples living in small communities and empowered to transform society with assistance from the institutional church. It seems that the Latin American bishops have been overcome by a collective amnesia about hierarchical authority and have openly introduced a new ecclesial paradigm—with Vatican approval, no less! One notable outcome of this paradigm shift is the leadership style of Pope Francis.

One reason for the high quality of H.'s work is his consultation with over a dozen members of the Catholic Theological Society of America and the Catholic Theology Society, of which he is a member. In his foreword, Peter Phan calls the book

“insightful and challenging,” not only for the reasons given here but also for H.’s application of semiotics to basic pastoral concepts.

Joseph Martos
Aquinas Institute of Theology, St. Louis

A Priestly People: Baptismal Priesthood and Priestly Ministry. By Jean-Pierre Torrell. Translated from the French by Peter Heinegg. New York: Paulist, 2013. Pp. xiv + 225. \$27.95.

In scanning Torrell’s table of contents I was struck by how the two middle chapters, comprising the historical-sources survey, leap from chapter 3’s treatment of Christian origins (through the early third century) over the ensuing 16 centuries to chapter 4’s examination of the documents of Vatican II. This stunning feature turns out to be a key to both T.’s theological argument and the impact he expects it to have on his anticipated audience.

Have the late patristic, medieval, Counter-Reformation, and modern Catholic periods nothing to contribute to a twenty-first-century Roman Catholic theology of the priesthood? T.’s answer: No. The primordial priesthood, as T. demonstrates in his early chapters, is that of Christ Jesus alone; whereas for the church, priesthood is first and foremost the birthright and mission of all the baptized, a “royal” body whom those in ordered ministry are to build up as a prophetic, sacrificial witness to the kingdom of God. Deploring (his term) the post-third-century devolution of priesthood, in both East and West, away from a collegial ministry of presbyters with bishops into a sacral cult of individual mediators, T. demonstrates how in the West three long-influential texts attributed to Ambrose and Jerome together comprise “the launching point of an error that would make itself felt all the way up to the eve of Vatican II” (157). Concerning Trent’s teaching about priesthood, T. avers that “in truth its importance today is more historical than doctrinal” (158), for subsequent generations “inherited from the texts that were promulgated a singularly atrophied vision of the ministry” (160). Countering detractors (contemporary and current) of the reform of ordered ministry clearly intended by *Lumen gentium* and *Presbyterorum ordinis*, T.’s careful biblical, historical, and theological work supports his reading of these texts as showing “that the ‘novelty’ of the Council, which has been accused of doing so much harm, was in reality no more than a return to the sources. If there was any ‘novelty,’ then it was with respect to a situation of entirely relative ‘antiquity’ that was based on many dubious elements” (162).

T.’s scholarly stand amid the current polemics over the reception of Vatican II points toward his anticipated audience and, impressively, his own academic/theological location. For who, after all, might be those accusing Vatican II, in its ecclesiology and theology of orders, of having done so much harm? In his preface T. states bluntly that the polarization—across left and right extremes—about the office and functions of the presbyterate has as its root cause “the enhanced valuation of the priesthood of the